

ANNEX 7.3: CONSULTANTS RESPONSE TO ISSUES RAISED AT PRESENTATION SESSIONS

Section 1: Main Session Comments

Response to Comments of Stakeholder Workshop on the DFR Presentation

Part 1: Main Session Comments		
	Consultants Response	Consultants Additional Clarification
<p>1 Eng Jane Ndirangu : Coordinator-SIDA Roads 2000 Nyanza</p> <p>Proposes subdivision of indicators instead of grouping indicators e.g. performance indicators'-transport sector impact indicators – environmental and socio-economic</p>	<p>The SIDA Roads 2000 Coordinators Proposal appears to be bear merit. It is recommended that this suggestion be trialed in the Ministry of Planning Directorate of Monitoring and Evaluation.</p>	<p>A sentence noting this point has been introduced in the Final Report</p>
<p>2 Hezbon Makobongo: Ministry of Planning Directorate of Monitoring and Evaluation</p> <p>Table 4.1-Overall road and data summary- should be reframed? - Items put as output and inputs are indicators</p> <p>Section: 5.2 Column two – indicator grouping, the output is also an indicator, need to stress on output/outcome instead of input- inputs are least felt.</p> <p>One output may be due to several inputs, this aspect needs to be captured in the summary table</p> <p>Targets to be achieved must be monitored to confirm that the objectives are being met</p>	<p><i>Professor. O. O. Mbeche</i>, from UNES emphasized that the comments made on inputs, outputs and impacts required data sets at project level, from relevant departments</p> <p>The relative importance of inputs vs. outputs is perhaps a subjective matter, depending on the sub-sector and importance of the indicator</p> <p>Important Comment: the Consultant Team Agrees</p>	<p>The sentence of clarification has been introduced in the Final Report</p> <p>The sentence of clarification has been introduced in the Final Report</p> <p>The sentence noting this point has been introduced in the Final Report</p> <p>A sentence has been introduced in the Final Report</p>
<p>Urged all the participants at the workshop to attend the stakeholder's workshop on <i>Ministerial Indicators</i>.</p>	<p>Important Comment: the Consultant Team Agrees</p>	<p>A sentence has been introduced in the Final Report mentioning this initiative.</p>
<p>4 Eric Goss: Coordinator: AfD Roads 2000 Central Province</p> <p>Indicators are not sub-divided into input, outputs and impacts</p>	<p><i>Professor. O. O. Mbeche</i>, from UNES emphasized that the comments made on inputs, outputs and impacts required data sets at project level, from relevant departments including the Vehicle Inspectorate, Traffic Planning and Materials Department. He recommended that data be collated at the local level for districts and provinces, and aggregated at national/global level for policy and planning.</p>	<p>A sentence has been introduced in the Final Report</p>

Part 1: Main Session Comments		
	Consultants Response	Consultants Additional Clarification
<p>9 Tom Opiyo: AfDB Table should be reorganized to have inputs, outputs and impacts and their relationship to achievement of vision 2030</p>	<p>The linkages to Vision 2030 have been included previously. The issue of inputs, outputs and impacts is addressed in the response indicated above.</p>	

Section 2: Social and Environmental Issues

Part 2: Social and Environmental Issues		
	Consultants Response	Consultants Additional Clarification
<p>11 Eng. Jane Ndirangu: Coordinator-SIDA Roads 2000 Nyanza HIV-no of people with HIV- how do you establish the baseline?</p>	<p>Kiogora said it is established by encouraging VCT visits and use of discrete figures from VCT's overtime</p> <p>HIV awareness is not incorporated in some road investment programs</p> <p>Data from NACC-was data used? There Yes-data presented in terms of administrative boundaries</p> <p>No data is available by sector. Data available is on a national and geographical level.</p>	<p>Question Responded to during Presentation</p>
<p>12 Eric Goss: Coordinator: AFD Roads 2000 Central Province The area of study for HIV seem large and difficult to get a good picture and therefore HIV prevalence may not be a good indicator since the practicability is difficult. He suggested a PhD thesis perhaps to collect all the data for use as indicator.</p>	<p>Kiogora - referred to Team presentation and which indicated that the exercise was to sieve some indicators to be used by the PS and the Minister</p>	<p>Question Responded to during Presentation</p>
<p>13 Engineer Githenji The only way to establish the awareness by estimating the rate of condom use. This has been practiced from the North Rift and could be borrowed. The rate of Condom use can be used as an awareness measure.</p>	<p>Experts Response following Presentation:</p>	<p>Condom use is a detailed intervention in the more substantive indicator outlined in the DFR: "Reduction in the No. of employees living with HIV/AIDS by gender". It is actually an activity by the contractors at the roads project level - whose data is not available systematically at the central level (as noted in the DFR</p>
<p>14 Keno Municipal Engineer Mbasa Need to establish sect oral HIV prevalence rates from medical practitioners. Emphasis to be put in incorporating HIV as part of project deliverable</p>	<p>Experts Response following Presentation:</p>	<p>(A) Data from medical practitioners This again is a detail - to be worked on later by the sector actors. The DFR Baseline Data Requirements obligates the actors to establish:</p>

Part 2: Social and Environmental Issues		
	Consultants Response	Consultants Additional Clarification
		"The number of employees living with HIV/AIDS- by gender". (b) Incorporating HIV/AIDS As part of the Project Deliverable The Framework outlines in the DFR that, the substantive Indicators for the sector actors here will be: "Significant Reduction in the Rate of HIV/AIDS Prevalence". So the question is already addressed.
15 Engineer Kimani We focus on number of people seeking services	Prof. Mbeche -impact of road on living standards is also be carried out along the northern corridor and HIV AIDS increase and reduction rates.	Question Responded to during Presentation
16 David Ochieng: Economist, Ministry of Transport Awareness has been created among Long distances Truck Drivers plying the Northern Corridor, provision of VCT, condoms, etc. We need to adopt awareness levels as an indicator.	Experts Response following Presentation:	The DFR shows this in the report as an Impact Indicator: Sustained Awareness creation on HIV/AIDS pandemic".
17 Tom Opiyo: AfDB How are the indicators on governance established? We need to have a measurable approach What do you mean by adequacy of transport?	Experts Response following Presentation: Mr. Kiogora: mentioned costs, speeds, access, construction, maintenance, wastage, public satisfaction.	The DFR does indeed adequately outline a framework for the generation of required Baseline Data and the type of Monitoring and Impact Indicators to measure the "Governance of the Sector". Of course as a "framework", it does not go into details of how to go about conducting the baseline survey. Question Responded to during Presentation
18 Eng. Agingu What is the impact of improved transport on agricultural production and marketing/trade?	Mr. Kiogora - Table on socio-economic indicators at operational level – improved productivity and living standards, improved level of consumption of produce and access	Question Responded to during Presentation

Section 3: Data Storage and Dissemination Issues

Part 3: Data Storage and Dissemination Issues		
	Consultants Response	Consultants Additional Clarification
<p>19 Eng Jane Ndirangu: Coordinator-SIDA Roads 2000 Nyanza How will incompatible data be harmonized and stored?</p>	<p>Mr. Wasonga: UNES -this can be achieved by designing standard data collection sheets to conform to the data requirement need and the anticipated input/outputs- Executive summary section 04 provides the chronology.</p>	<p>Question Responded to during Presentation</p>
<p>20 Juma Ahmed Ali: Maritime Suggestion platform to design to respond to all institutions from which data are sourced. Creating obligations will create a central depository centre – a data bank</p>	<p>This is an interesting proposal and perhaps a useful way forward in terms of system usage and updating.</p>	<p>Appropriate text has been appended to the <i>Final Report</i>.</p>
<p>21 David Ochieng: Economist, Ministry of Transport The design is an assignment on Ministry of Transport and soon design will be undertaken</p> <p>Are the emerging issues part of TOR, if not then they form part of phase 2 study?</p>	<p>This is key information for the TSIF Study.</p> <p>This is key information for the TSIF Study with which the Consultants concur.</p>	<p>It is considered to be pre-mature for the Team to specify detailed data collection procedures without access to full details of the design / implementation phase.</p> <p>This is key information for the TSIF Study.</p>
<p>22 Erick Goss: Coordinator: AfD Roads 2000 Central Province Now is to establish baseline, the excel tables are incomplete. The IT systems will be based on this data.</p> <p>Who will be collecting data? How often will the data be collected?</p>	<p>Consultants Response</p> <p>The UNES Team are following up to specific agencies.</p> <p>Tables 4.1- 4.9 of the DFR have specified data sources. It is not an easy matter to specify who will collect the data from the specified sources since the Consultants understand that the systems design will be undertaken by another Consultant to the Ministry of Transport. It is suggested, at least initially, that the data are collected on an annual basis</p>	<p>Mr. Ochieng suggests adding a new table to the Consultants <i>Final Report</i>, providing that new data are received in time to do so.</p> <p>Appropriate text has been appended to the <i>Final Report</i>.</p>

Section 4 Updated Data Issues

Part 4: Main Session Comments: Data Issues		
	Consultants Response	Consultants Additional Clarification
<p>3 Eng. Merali: Director Kenya Roads Board-Rep Kenya Transport association</p> <p>The information presented are generated from the Kenyan conditions, we need data from neighbouring countries whose trucks ply our road-There is need to harmonize data along the corridor.</p>	<p>Prof. Mbeche said the data presented is in aggregate form and all inclusive, the specific data referred to is available from the Northern Corridor e.g. release time at the border posts and travel time.</p>	<p>Question Responded to during Presentation</p>
<p>4 Eric Goss: Coordinator: AfD Roads 2000 Central Province</p> <p>What is lectured does not tally with data on the table</p> <p>Data on road length indicates 1925 killed per month page of table, 24000 people killed</p> <p>Total road length of Road Class ABC maintained is indicated as 52,000, while actual 12,000</p> <p>There is need to enlarge the excel sheet to accommodate all parameters</p>	<p>Prof. Mbeche provided explanations below</p> <p>Prof. Mbeche said the accident data are annual figures</p> <p>Prof. Mbeche said the road classes are ABCDE constituting the 52000 Km (all road classifications).</p>	<p>Question Responded to during Presentation</p> <p>Question Responded to during Presentation</p> <p>Question Responded to during Presentation</p> <p>See Response to Item 10 below (Ministry of Transport)</p>
<p>5 Mr. Ongongo: Kenya Railways Table 4.22</p> <p>Useful data captured</p> <p>Infrastructure-need to refine input/output items</p> <p>Length of mainline and shunting-shunting use is not clear (whether it refers to loops). Main link- how was the % has been obtained. Made two proposals: (1). Main line-any line built to main line standards by weight and bridge. Currently the mainlines are between Mombasa- Nairobi-1083 Km, and 60km Nairobi – Thika and Nakuru - Mau Summit-24 Km -the stated length in the report is longer than the actual (To improve data on rail length) (2) Electrified mainline does not exist and should be deleted</p> <p>Branch Line- data could be availed later</p>	<p>Data Items listed sought after follow-up with the Respondent following an email sent on April 9th, 2009</p> <p>This could be an item for an enhancement of the TSIF, in due course.</p> <p>This is a useful comment</p>	<p>To be appended to supplementary data table, if new data arrives in time.</p> <p>Appropriate text has been appended to the <i>Final Report</i>.</p> <p>Appropriate text has been appended to the <i>Final Report</i>.</p>
	<p>This could be an item for an enhancement of the TSIF, in due course.</p>	<p>Appropriate text has been appended to the <i>Final Report</i>.</p>

Part 4: Main Session Comments: Data Issues		
	Consultants Response	Consultants Additional Clarification
<p>Infrastructure and equipments are grouped together in the report and yet they are distinct. He corrected that; Infrastructure deals with rail line while equipments includes wagons and locomotives</p> <p>Proposed consideration of efficiency of service delivery as an indicator (wagon turnarounds - measured in days)-The total ton Km of freight currently at about 1.4m ton-km /per year as at 2006.</p> <p>Proposed definition of project, local and global indicator levels</p> <p>Additional data is available at KR upon request</p>	<p>Correction noted.</p> <p>This could be an item for an enhancement of the TSIF, in due course.</p> <p>This is consistent with the overall classification system recommended by the ToR.</p> <p>Consultants Team followed up on April 9th, 2009</p>	<p>Appropriate text has been appended to the <i>Final Report</i>.</p> <p>Appropriate text has been appended to the <i>Final Report</i>.</p>
<p>6 Juma Ahmed Ali: Maritime Transport Table 4.24</p> <p>Maritime transport summarized under Kenya Ports Authority- statistics does not include inland water transport. Infrastructure includes inland water transport Kisumu, Kenya Maritime shipping line, costal transport. Other small ports like Lamu and Shimoni to be captured and their input and output indicators</p> <p>Other small ports like Lamu and Shimoni to be captured and their input and output indicators</p> <p>Fishing Vessels are registered and updated data could be availed.- lake side and ocean coast</p>	<p>Data Items listed sought after follow-up with the Respondent following an email sent on April 9th, 2009</p> <p>This could be an item for an enhancement of the TSIF, in due course.</p>	<p>To be appended to supplementary data table, if new data arrives in time.</p> <p>Appropriate text has been appended to the <i>Final Report</i>.</p>
<p>7 Doris Kariuki: Air transport Table 4.23</p> <p>Different types of aircrafts- there is need to capture equipments from the operators at JKIA for a comprehensive reporting</p> <p>Separate cargo and passengers- data is general</p> <p>Safety and security-this is critical-different operators have their procedures</p> <p>More data on KQ can be accessed through her office.</p>	<p>Data Items listed sought after follow-up with the Respondent following an email sent on April 9th, 2009</p> <p>This could be an item for an enhancement of the TSIF, in due course.</p> <p>This is a useful comment</p> <p>This is a useful comment</p> <p>Consultants Team followed up on April 9th, 2009</p>	<p>To be appended to supplementary data table, if new data arrives in time.</p> <p>Appropriate text has been appended to the <i>Final Report</i>.</p> <p>Appropriate text has been appended to the <i>Final Report</i>.</p> <p>Appropriate text has been appended to the <i>Final Report</i>.</p>

Part 4: Main Session Comments: Data Issues		
	Consultants Response	Consultants Additional Clarification
<p>Merali KRB– Number of airlines scheduled- local or international destinations? Number of flights per week, per day, per month</p>		Appropriate text has been appended to the <i>Final Report</i> .
<p>8 Eng. Kimani: Roads Dept.</p> <p>Output performance indicators should be parametric-numerical values E.g. % of money spent on roads from donors. Spent sums to bench marked to international standards e.g. in dollars</p> <p>Recommended that the TSIF should show many roads done per unit area and benchmarked to International standards</p> <p>1645 AADT – there need to be composition to make meaning. Accident numbers- what are the safety thresholds?</p>	<p>The basis of the TSIF is denominated in Kenyan Currency. Exchange rates are variable hence the KShs. is retained for all road infrastructure.</p> <p>This is a very interesting comment and perhaps a useful way forward.</p>	<p>Appropriate text has been appended to the <i>Final Report</i>.</p> <p>Appropriate text has been appended to the <i>Final Report</i>.</p> <p>Appropriate text has been appended to the <i>Final Report</i>.</p>
<p>9 Tom Opiyo: AfDB</p> <p>Need to include travel time and a transport indicator-baseline and current conditions</p> <p>No indicator in Urban scenarios- e.g congestion levels</p> <p>Indicators relating to trade and regional integration need to included</p>	<p>Prof. Mbeche -Travel time is available for the NC is available. There is need for surveys on other roads and data sets at project level.</p> <p>The Urban Pages were omitted since UNES had no data.</p> <p>This suggestion would broaden the TSIF beyond the scope of the ToR. It is more appropriate within the MoP M&E system.</p>	<p>Question Responded to during Presentation</p> <p>These pages could be appended in due course when data become available.</p> <p>A note of clarification has been added to the Executive Summary</p>
<p>10 David Ochieng: Economist, Ministry of Transport</p> <p>Gaps missing in the report should be introduced in a new table. The existing table should be maintained being starting point</p>	<p>Data Items listed will be collected after follow up to the Consultants email inquiry, as appropriate</p>	